Affirming something by affirming its opposite

LEARN ABOUT ISLAM.NET Spreading the Message of Islam

Affirming something by affirming its opposite

Translated by Abu Abdirrahmaan Nasser ibn Najam

Taken from the works of Shaykh Muhammad ibn Saalih al 'Uthaymeen (رَحِمَهُالله '

بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم

With regards to qiyaas ul 'aks, the Shaykh Muhammad ibn Saalih al 'Uthaymeen (رَحِمَهُ اللهُ)¹ comments:

So when the Prophet (صلى الله عليه وسلم) affirmed this³, they (رضي الله عنهم) were content with this.

But when he said,

And in the sexual relations of one of you is a sadaqah...

- meaning that a man when he approaches his wife (for sexual intercourse), then for him is a sadaqah for him in that - they said -

O Messenger of Allaah, does one of us fulfil his desires and there is reward for him in that?

- seeking to know (the answer) and not out of objection. But they wished to know the reason behind that – how does a person come to his wife and (fulfil) his desires, and (yet) it is said "you will certainly be rewarded".

Meaning that a person may deem this unlikely to occur.

However the Prophet (صلى الله عليه وسلم) clarified the reason for that to them, by saying:

Do you consider if he were to fulfil it in a forbidden act - would there be a sin upon him?

rad iyallahu 'anhum) May Allaah the Most High be pleased with them (رضى الله عنهم)



^{1 (}رَحِمَهُ اللهُ) (rahimahullaah) May Allaah the Most High have mercy on him

^{2 (}صلى الله عَليه وسلم) (sallallaahu 'alayhi wa sallam) May the peace and blessings of Allaah the Most High be upon him

³ That the poor people could give sadaqah by making the legislated words of remembrance, as mentioned in the 25th of an Nawawee's 40 ahaadeeth:

[[]Aboo Dharr, (عني الله عليه وسلم), reported that some of the Companions of the Messenger of Allaah, (رضي الله عليه وسلم), said to him: "O Messenger of Allaah, the rich have taken away all the rewards. They observe the prayer as we do, and they keep the fasts as we do, and they give sadaqah (charity) from their surplus riches." Upon this he (the Prophet) said: "Has Allaah not prescribed for you (a course) by following which you can also do sadaqah? Verily in every tasbih (i.e. saying Subhanallah) there is a sadaqah, every takbir (i.e. saying Allahu Akbar) is a sadaqah, every tahmid (i.e. saying Alhamdulillah) is a sadaqah, every tahlil (i.e. saying Lailaha illallah) is a sadaqah, enjoining of good is a sadaqah, forbidding of evil is a sadaqah, and having sexual intercourse with your wife is a sadaqah. They (the Companions) said: "O Messenger of Allaah, is there reward for him who satisfies his sexual passion among us?" He said: "Tell me, if he were to devote it to something forbidden, would it not be a sin on his part? Similarly, if he were to devote it to something lawful, he should have a reward."] Reported in Saheeh Muslim.

Affirming something by affirming its opposite

And the answer is, yes, there would be a sin upon him if he were to fulfil it in a forbidden action.

He (صلى الله عليه وسلم) said:

And likewise if he were to fulfil it in a permissible action, there would be reward for him.

So (this person) would have managed without (falling into) the forbidden action, so he would be rewarded for this.

And this is what is known as qiyaas ul 'aks (literally 'analogy of the opposite') by the scholars – meaning if this is established, then its opposite is established in its opposite (case).

(Sharh al Arba'een an-Nawawee (p 252) of Shaykh Muhammad ibn Saalih al 'Uthaymeen (رَحِمَهُ اللهُ))